Comments on "Thermally induced rotons in two-dimensional dilute Bose gases"

Sang-Hoon Kim*
Division of Liberal Arts & Sciences, Mokpo National Maritime University, Mokpo 530-729, Republic of Korea

PACS numbers: 05.30.-d, 05.30.Jp, 03.75.Hh

arXiv:0810.3051v1 [cond-mat.stat-mech] 17 Oct 2008

In a study of interacting Bose particles the effective interaction, g, which contains pairwise interaction between atoms is an essential factor. In 3D it depends on the scattering length only such as $g(3) = 4\pi\hbar^2 a/m$, where m is the atomic mass and a is the s-wave scattering length. However, in general, it depends on momentum, too. In $D < 4$ dimensional case, the form of the D-dimensional effective interaction $g(D)$ has been suggested by Nogueira and Kleinert in 2006.[1] The final form is shown at the Eq. (8) of the paper as

$$g(D) = \frac{4\pi^{D/2}\hbar^2 a^{D-2}}{m} \frac{1}{2^{2-D}\Gamma(1-\frac{D}{2})\gamma^{D-2} + \Gamma(\frac{D}{2}-1)}, \quad (1)$$

where Γ is the Gamma function and γ is the dimensionless gas parameter in D-dimension given by $\gamma = na^D \ll 1$, where n is the D-dimensional gas density.

However, actually, the above form of $g(D)$ is not correct. The correct form is slightly different from Eq. (1) in the exponent of the γ. It is

$$g(D) = \frac{4\pi^{D/2}\hbar^2 a^{D-2}}{m} \frac{1}{2^{2-D}\Gamma(1-\frac{D}{2})\gamma^{D/2-1} + \Gamma(\frac{D}{2}-1)}. \quad (2)$$

The mistake of the Eq. (1) came from the error that in the final step of the derivation of the paper they chose $pa \to na^D = \gamma$ instead of $pa \to \sqrt{na^D} = \sqrt{\gamma}$, where p is the momentum.

The mistake is trivial but a direct substitution of the formula in Eq. (1) into any D-dimensional problem leads a wrong result. For example, the Eq. (1) cannot reproduce the well-known 2D results of Bosons by M. Schick.[2] Only the formula in Eq. (2) in a D-dimensional Boson research produces correct ones.[3] Average theoretical physicist who uses the formula $g(D)$ would not make the mistake, but we feel to comment for that because its role of $g(D)$ is critical in D-dimensional researches.

* Electronic address: shkim@mmu.ac.kr

[1] F. S. Nogueira and H. Kleinert, Phys. Rev. B **73**, 104515 (2006).
[2] M. Schick, Phys. Rev. A **3**, 1067 (1971).
[3] S.-H. Kim and M. P. Das, arXiv:0808.3288v1 [cond-mat.stat-mech] (2008).